

## Quantitative Analysis of the Foreign Language Anxiety: Chinese and Pakistani Postgraduates in Focus

**Sameena Malik**

Department of English & Applied Linguistics, Faculty of Social Sciences  
College of Foreign Languages, Huazhong University of Science and Technology  
Wuhan, P.R. China  
(Corresponding Author)

**Huang Qin**

Department of English & Applied Linguistics, Faculty of Social Sciences  
College of Foreign Languages, Huazhong University of Science and Technology  
Wuhan, P.R. China

**Said Muhammad khan**

Department of English Language and Applied Linguistics, Faculty of Social Sciences  
YELI, Yanbu University College, Yanbu, Saudi Arabia

**Khalid Ahmed**

Department of English Language & Applied Linguistics, Faculty of Social Sciences  
University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

### Abstract

The current research study aims at inspecting various levels of apprehension and anxiety faced by university postgraduates in Pakistan and China when learning a foreign language (FL). The target population of this research was the university postgraduates from a Chinese university in Wuhan, and a public sector university in Lahore, Pakistan. The sample of this study was 206 postgraduates, out of which 106 (male=28, female= 78) from a Chinese university and 100 (male=53, female= 47) from a Pakistani university in Lahore. The sample was selected randomly and aged (21-30), and all participants belonged to the postgraduate level. Horwitz's foreign language classroom anxiety scale (known as FLCAS) was used as a survey model, a theoretical framework for collecting data from both universities. The Statistical Package of a Social Sciences (SPSS version23) was used to get quantitative results. Descriptive statistics were used to investigate the anxiety level. Mean score and standard deviation were computed of both groups, besides it, the independent samples t-test was run to compare the mean score of both groups and infer if there existed any difference in the target language anxiety level. The results revealed that Chinese postgraduates face more anxiety than Pakistani postgraduates, and there existed significant differences in foreign language anxiety levels of both groups. Based on the results, it can be implicated that combined efforts of mentors and students can pave the way in tackling anxiety among university postgraduates.

**Keywords:** anxiety, apprehension, anxiety levels, foreign language, university postgraduates

**Cite as:** Malik, S., Qin, H., khan, S. M., & Ahmed, K. (2020). Quantitative Analysis of the Foreign Language Anxiety: Chinese and Pakistani Postgraduates in Focus. *Arab World English Journal*, 11 (1) 315-330. DOI: <https://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awej/vol11no1.23>

## Introduction

Learning a language has always been an exigent task for second language acquisition learners of many Asian countries (Malik, Qin, Asif, & Khan, 2020). Psycholinguists have shed light on the significance of English language anxiety and concluded that anxiety does have a debilitating effect on foreign language learners' performance (Abbas & Iqbal, 2018). Anxiety can be termed as the type of edginess, disturbance, predicament, nervousness, and has been considered as a psychological issue on the part of foreign language learners (Bailey, 1983; MacIntyre & Gardner, 1994; Tschumi & Young 1994).

The language anxiety has been considered as the most intricate and complex mental phenomenon of human psychology (Trylong, 1987). The psycholinguists concluded that an enormous number of foreign language acquisition learners suffer from anxiety, which causes stammering and stuttering among them. This is an unavoidable issue that has sought the attention of many linguists and researchers around the globe (Abbas, Pervaiz, & Arshad, 2018) Anxiety felt while learning the target and second language is one of the significant issues in the target language development process and learning, procedure and the major source of debilitating anxiety (Malik et al., 2020). In the past, pedagogical teaching and foreign language learning were limited to teacher and teaching methodologies (Abbas, Jalil, & Rehman, 2019).

Learner's sentiments and feelings were considered an inevitable source with the advent of the humanistic approach, and the world witnessed a remarkable shift to learners and learning (Bhatti & Memon, 2016). Anxiety is the most dominant factor among all affective filters (Oxford, 1999). Numerous researches have so far been directed towards the prospective relationship of target or second language anxiety level of learners with their academic performance or proficiency in various foreign language learning procedures ( MacIntyre & Gardner, 1994; Young, 1991). Many types of research indicated that there lies an unconstructive connection between academic performance and target language acquisition anxiety (Horwitz, Horwitz, & Cope, 1986; MacIntyre & Charos, 1996). Plentiful studies have dealt with this multifaceted issue of target language acquisition in learners of both in west and Asia demonstrating mixed results, either moderate or high anxiety level among students (Rachman, 1998).

The current research is an attempt to explore the anxiety level of FL learners from two culturally different Asian countries, such as Pakistan and China. Comparison has been made among EFL learners of one of the prestigious universities in central China, Wuhan and Lahore, Pakistan. The study of the anxiety level of both Asian countries' postgraduates and the correlation between foreign language anxiety and demographical factors will contribute depth and breadth to the existing literature as no such comparison has been made earlier. However, this enquiry will further enlighten the aspects of target language acquisition for potential research in the realm of cognitive linguistics for target and foreign language students and mentors.

## Literature Review

Anxiety has been defined as some disturbing state of mind, edginess, and threatening situation (Koba, Ogawa, & Wilkinson, 2000; Ohata, 2005). In foreign and target language acquisition, students often get unstable, boredom, indistinct, fright, and encounter edginess (Scovel, 1978; Gregersen, 2005; Ohata, 2005; Marwan, 2016). (Goshi, 2005) research study through FLCAS

searched and explored that there are an association and relation between second and target language learners' level of apprehension and their perceptions in the acquisition of target language. Cubukcu(2007)investigated anxiety level and its relationship to foreign language acquisition and concluded that fear of being negatively evaluated, losing face, making errors and fearful feeling of not getting desired goals and grades increase anxiety level

Huang (2004) examined the anxiety level of gender and relationship of anxiety with motivation, time spent, and willingness to study after school time in the Taiwanese context. FLCAS was distributed among 502 learners and found out that anxiety level was higher in females, and those who had spent more time in learning a foreign language since childhood were found less anxious. Toubot & Seng's, (2018) study resulted in higher anxiety level among the fourth year Libyan postgraduates

In the study of Shi & Liu (2006) they investigated different stages of second language acquisition anxiety among students according to their proficiency levels and resulted that learners with high proficiency experience less anxiety, whereas those with low proficiency were found more anxious. Karatas et al., (2016)examined foreign language anxiety levels with gender, proficiency, and type of school; they graduated from 320 samples of Istanbul Technical University and his research study concluded in the advanced level of anxiety among females than males.

Öztürk & Gürbüz (2013) experimented foreign language classroom anxiety scale to compute the target language acquisition nervousness and anxiety level of university postgraduates and resulted that those who have English preparatory training had lower anxiety level than those who didn't receive, besides females were found suffering high anxiety level than males.

Marcos-Llinás & Garau (2009) investigated anxiety level at three diverse aptitude and proficiency stages by using FLACS at 134 samples of Spanish students at the USA and it was analysing that the foreign language learners of the advance level were found experiencing highest anxiety level while the beginner level learners were found least anxious. The researcher deduced that the advance level learners are more conscious about the purpose of foreign language acquisition and prepare themselves for more challenges and employability, which makes them more anxious than beginners, thus getting their anxiety level higher. However, few researchers like Hismanoglu (2013) worked on a comprehensive study on foreign language anxiety in Turkey and resulted that advance learners have low anxiety levels as compared to beginners.

Research on foreign language anxiety in Pakistan kept demonstrating in various contexts. Some Pakistani researchers (Adeel, 2011; Azher, Anwar, & Naz, 2010; Gopang, Bughio, & Pathan, 2018) have contributions in the existing literature of foreign language anxiety and paved the way for future researchers in psycholinguistics. In China, Wei (2014) have persistently researched among Chinese students and used FLCAS to measure the anxiety intensity of Bouyei College FL learners and found a moderate level of anxiety of Chinese postgraduates. Naudhani, Wu, & Naudhani (2018) found a high level of anxiety while conducting research between two groups of Chinese students in China i.e., English majors and non- English majors and the latter group was found experiencing a high level of anxiety. As far as present research is concerned, it

is an attempt to investigate the anxiety level towards the foreign language being taught as a second language in Pakistan and China as well.

### **Objectives of the Current Research**

The prime objective of this research project is to find out the target anxiety level among Pakistani and Chinese learners. The second objective is to find the difference of anxiety among Pakistani and Chinese postgraduates.

### **Research Questions**

1. What is the apprehension and anxiety level among Pakistani and Chinese postgraduates in learning foreign language in universities?
2. Does there exist any significant difference between Pakistani and Chinese postgraduates' anxiety level?

### **Hypothesis**

Following hypothesis were made to explore the difference in anxiety level of the postgraduates.

H<sub>0</sub>: There is no significant difference between Pakistani and Chinese postgraduates' anxiety level.

H<sub>1</sub>: There is a significant difference between Pakistani and Chinese postgraduates' anxiety level.

### **Population and Sampling**

The respondents of this study were selected from one of the public sector universities in Lahore, Pakistan, and their first language was Urdu and studying English as a target and foreign language. A sample of 100 Pakistani learners (male=53, female= 47) from the public sector university filled the questionnaire While Chinese 106(male =28, female= 78) participants from one of the famous universities in central China, Wuhan. All postgraduates were aged (21-30) and were learning English as a compulsory course.

### **Instrument**

Horwitz et al. (1986) famous theory of target or foreign anxiety inside the classroom was used as a theoretical framework and survey model for collecting primary data from Chinese and Pakistani participants. The survey was based on 33 items and three sub-anxieties i.e., test anxiety, communication apprehension, and fear of negative evaluation. Each anxiety contains 11 items. The first part was used to gather demographic bio-data like age and gender etc. Scale for determining FL anxiety level was kept count on a five-point Likert scale ranging from "strongly agree" with the topmost level of anxiety to "strongly disagree" with lowermost anxiety level.

### **Data Collection and Method**

A questionnaire was distributed among university postgraduates in one of the Public Sector University in Lahore, Pakistan and Chinese University situated in Central China, Wuhan. Survey was administered by the researcher. Responses of all participants were entered and analysed by using SPSS 23. Firstly, descriptive statistics was performed to find out the percentage and general response of every item associated with FL anxiety of learners inside the classroom. Independent samples-t-test was employed too to find out the variation in anxiety levels of Pakistani and Chinese postgraduates.

### Data Analysis

The Statistical Package of Social Sciences (SPSS) 23 was used to analyze the results of FLCAS items and the five-point Likert scale was used for data collection from Chinese and Pakistani postgraduates. Descriptive statistics were obtained to get the description like mean score and standard deviation. Secondly, Independent samples t-tests were also run to identify the difference between groups regarding anxiety level.

### Results

The researcher in the first research question focuses on exploring the FL anxiety level among Pakistani and Chinese postgraduates. To respond the first research question, FLCAS was divided into three sub-anxieties i.e. communication apprehension which is often called as speaking anxiety as well, the second is test anxiety and third corresponded to as fear of negative evaluation. The obtained results and elucidation of both variables i.e. Chinese postgraduates and Pakistani postgraduates are given below:

#### Research Question 1

In research question # 1, the objective was to scrutinize the second or foreign anxiety level of both groups i.e., Pakistani and Chinese postgraduates. The descriptive statistics is given below of three sub-anxieties.

In table 1, the 11 items from FLCAS reflect communication nervousness between two groups i.e. Pakistani and Chinese postgraduates. The data in the above table demonstrates that Pakistani postgraduates suffer from a moderate level of communication anxiety or apprehension ( $M=2.89$ ,  $SD=1.024$ ), while Chinese postgraduates undergo a higher level of communication anxiety ( $M=3.08$ ,  $SD=1.048$ ).

A great number of learners from both groups agreed to be anxious while communicating with others (see table 1). The majority of Chinese postgraduates reported the lack of self-efficacy is the cause of communication apprehension thus, similar to Horwitz (1986) statement that anxious students prefer to be back benchers in order to avoid interaction and communicating with others which can be a source of embarrassment for them.

Target anxiety of FL affects the target language learners' language attainment and abilities to a great extent and impedes in getting desired results in the target language. Communication apprehension has a strong relationship with foreign language anxiety as students not merely find difficulty in communication rather in the comprehension of what others say too (Horwitz et al., 1986). They avoid class and group discussions, presentations, and interpersonal skills, which, as a result, leads them to poor performance.

In table 2, FLCAS items reflect the test anxiety of Pakistani and Chinese postgraduates, in which a noteworthy difference can be seen between two groups. Pakistani postgraduates feel moderate test anxiety ( $M=2.72$ ,  $SD=1.12$ ), whereas Chinese learners ( $M=3$ ,  $SD=1.051$ ). According to Horwitz et al., (1986) test anxiety is another type of reticent which is caused by a fear of failure and low self-esteem. Sarason (1984) is of the view that test performance anxiety is induced because of self-assumptions of students accompanied by negative thoughts and low grades in academics.

Chinese students found to be more anxious because of being proficient in native language and agreed on facing failures because of poor foreign language skills. These experiences divert learners' attention in class and thus results in poor presentation and performance.

Table 3, indicates FLCAS last anxiety type i.e. fear of negative assessment/evaluation among Pakistani and Chinese postgraduates. The outcome of responses reveal that Pakistani postgraduates were found experiencing fear of negative evaluation anxiety too although taken as a whole the mean score was still less than Chinese postgraduates. Pakistani postgraduates ( $M=3.14$ ,  $SD=1.073$ ), whereas Chinese learners ( $M=3.13$ ,  $SD=1.07$ ).

To a great extent, fear of negative assessment/ evaluation is closer to test performance anxiety, however, unlike test anxiety the concept of negative evaluation is taken on broader, micro and macro level and usually others are being evaluated negatively in social context. While test anxiety is limited specifically to academic context which induce anxiety within classroom settings.

The learners who are suffering from fear of negative evaluations are not critical much about their individuality rather they tend to avoid by not interacting and participating in any discussion or discourse thus limiting themselves to concise talks (Gardner & MacIntyre, 1993).

In this comparative study of FL anxiety between Chinese and Pakistani learners both groups endorsed the view of getting anxious and reported fear of being negatively evaluated as anxiety inducing factor and as a result of which they are fear to lose their face. (T. Gregersen & Horwitz, 2002) the mental abilities, meta-cognitive skills and language acquisition process is adversely affected by negative evaluation of peers, fellows and mentors which makes their morale down and make them anxious learners of target language. The way they happen to communicate with people in foreign language might develop a kind of undesirable and general negative impact about them among people no matter if they are good or proficient user in other aspects of target language learning and acquisition process.

### Research Question 2

The purpose of second research question was to trace the anxiety level difference between Pakistani and Chinese postgraduates. It was hypothesized that there is no anxiety difference between both groups. Responding to the second research question independent samples t-tests was employed.

There is a noteworthy variation between anxiety level, of Chinese postgraduates ( $M=3.07$ ,  $SD=0.47$ );  $t= 2.642$ ,  $p$ -value (0.01), whereas Pakistani postgraduates ( $M=2.98$ ,  $SD=0.50$ );  $t= 0.269$ ,  $p$ -value (0.788). It is noted that in the first group  $p$ -value (0.01) is significant at 0.05 level,  $p < 0.05$ ; therefore, the null hypothesis is discarded and it can be explored that Chinese postgraduates are highly anxious than Pakistani postgraduates and there is considerable disparity between both groups' foreign language anxiety level.

### Findings

The outcomes and conclusion of the present research study demonstrate and reveal that massive number of the Chinese postgraduates, who took part in this study were found to be highly anxious

in all levels of foreign language anxiety i.e. communication apprehension, test anxiety and fear of negative evaluation. Pakistani postgraduates who filled the questionnaire also suffered from moderate anxiety levels as compared to Chinese target language learners. The overall results show that the most anxiety provoking items belong to Communication anxiety as both groups can be seen supporting the statements provoking communication anxiety. However, the bulk of Chinese postgraduates' mean score in communication anxiety is higher as compared to Pakistani learners.

The statement in table 1 "I never feel quite sure of myself when I am speaking in my foreign language class" indicates that Chinese postgraduates hesitate while speaking or communicating in foreign or second language owing to deficiency of self-confidence. Chinese learners) (M=3.07, SD=0.47) suffer from high anxiety while Pakistani students (M=2.98, SD=0.50) reflected mediocre level of anxiety.

Chinese students also showed agreement in the item "it makes me anxious, when I don't understand what an instructor is saying in a foreign language lecture" (M= 3.21, SD= 1.075) which shows that foreign or second language anxiety is a primary cause that affects the abilities and aptitudes of target language learners to a great extent and has a strong relationship with communication anxiety.

The statement "I tremble when I know I am going to be called on in a foreign language class" reveals moderate level of anxiety among both Chinese and Pakistani postgraduates; Chinese learners (M=2.79, SD=0.983), Pakistani learners (M=2.62, SD=1.17). In item "I keep thinking that other students are better than I am at foreign language" Chinese (M=3.11, SD=1.008), Pakistani (M=3.17, SD=1.1173) some of the items reveal moderate anxiety and some reveal higher than moderate. "I start to panic when I have to speak without preparation in class" reveals moderate anxiety of Pakistani postgraduates (M=2.9, SD=1.243), while Chinese learners were found to be highly anxious (M=3.17, SD=1.1).

In the second last statement of communication anxiety, Chinese postgraduates express their high anxiety level in the following statement "I worry about consequences of failing my foreign language class" Chinese (M=3.19, SD=1.088), Pakistani postgraduates (M=2.73, SD=1.196).

The findings reveal that significant number of postgraduates suffer from high communication anxiety level. These findings are in line with the seminal work of many researchers (He, 2017; Horwitz et al., 1986; Kitano, 2001; Landström, 2015) and in Chinese context, these findings are in line with (Shi & Liu, 2006; Naudhani et al., 2018).

In the Pakistani context, this study is consistent with (Mari, Umrani, & Umrani, 2012; Javed, Eng, Mohamed, & Sam, 2013; Gopang, Ansari, Kulsoom, & Laghari, 2017). The second anxiety generating items belong to test anxiety. In table 2, the statement "In foreign language class I get so nervous that I forget the things I know". Chinese postgraduates found with higher anxiety level, Chinese postgraduates (M=3, SD=1.051), Pakistani postgraduates (M=2.72, SD=1.12). (Horwitz et al., 1986), foreign language learners suffering from text anxiety often relate incorrect beliefs

and views in learning foreign language and set up unrealistic expectations and accept merely perfect performance in test otherwise failure.

In another statement “I get upset when I don’t understand what the teacher is correcting” Chinese postgraduates (M=3.38, SD=0.899), Pakistani postgraduates (M=2.93, SD=1.139). Chinese learners think that in order to speak accurately and meaningful utterances, every word of a mentor should be discernable so they can get a good image and not negative evaluation by their instructors.

In the item “I can feel my heart pounding when I am going to be called on in my class” Chinese postgraduates (M=3.11, SD=1.008), Pakistani postgraduates (M=2.47, SD=1.177) it supported the view that foreign language anxiety was an individual set of beliefs, concepts and feelings which can be felt while learning a foreign or second language in the classroom (Horwitz et al., 1986).

The third anxiety-provoking responses belong to fear of negative evaluation. In the statement “I always feel that the other students speak a foreign language better than I do” Chinese postgraduates (M=3.13, SD=1.07), Pakistani postgraduates (M=3.14, SD=1.073). In the following item both groups share the same views about being negatively evaluated and try to avoid participating in any discussion or activities thinking that others are better at speaking which keeps them anxious. In the same vein in item, “I feel very self-conscious about speaking foreign language in front of other students” Chinese postgraduates (M=3.32, SD=0.911), Pakistani postgraduates (M=3.19, SD=1.032), the students suffering from edginess and nervousness also feared being less capable, confident and competent than other target language learners and being negatively evaluated.

In the statement “I get nervous when I don’t understand every word the foreign instructor says” Chinese postgraduates (M=3.23, SD=0.908), Pakistani postgraduates (M=2.8, SD=1.082) and “I get nervous when the foreign instructor asks questions which I haven’t prepared” Chinese postgraduates (M=3.3, SD=0.841), Pakistani postgraduates (M=2.98, SD=1.155). According to Aid(1994) that kind of situations reflect personal opinion, views and perceptions about giving answers voluntarily and thus hinder them to participate actively.

In addition to it, the present study has also investigated the significant difference between the anxiety level of Chinese and Pakistani postgraduates. According to the result, language anxiety plays a pivotal role in the acquisition of target and foreign language, and there is a significant difference between Pakistani and Chinese learners’ anxiety level. Chinese learners found to be more anxious as P-value 0.01 is less than  $p < 0.05$ , and hence, the null hypothesis is rejected as p-value 0.01 is significant at 0.05 level.

## Discussion

The current research has addressed the following questions; What is the level of anxiety among Pakistani and Chinese postgraduates in learning a foreign language in universities? Is there any difference between Pakistani and Chinese postgraduates’ anxiety level? The findings reveal that anxiety does have a debilitating effect among university postgraduates, and they feel anxious about

learning a foreign and second language. The level of anxiety is reported high among Chinese learners. This finding is in line with previous research (Naudhani et al., 2018).

Many studies in the past supported the view that learners in Confucian countries like China, Korea and Japan suffer more from edginess and anxious feeling as compared to other countries. China is the country which has the largest number of foreign language but still they find it difficult to use in and outside of classroom and mostly feel anxious. Although a lot of significance has been given to Chinese foreign language learners to polish their skills, particularly in communication and linguistic skills, yet there is a scarcity of contact with native speakers (Liu & Braine, 2005).

Chinese postgraduates are found to be highly anxious at all three levels of FL anxiety i.e. communication apprehension, test anxiety and fear of negative evaluation. It could be so as they get slight chances of using target language and thus in most of the cases use first language. On the other hand, Pakistani postgraduates in this research have been reported to experience moderate level of anxiety which is in line with (Gopang et al., 2017).

In study of Javed et al., (2013) Pakistani students were also found to be anxious at different levels. However, it was also noted in the analysis result that respondents reported different responses to Foreign language anxiety scale items and some of the items were rated fairly high in language anxiety and vice versa. From this point of view, this study also supports Horwitz et al., (1986) that anxiety is a unique set of beliefs, aptitude and decorum specific to language acquisition. Besides, the result of independent samples t-test demonstrates that there is a significant difference of anxiety level exists between Chinese and Pakistani postgraduates as the p-value (0.01) is significant at 0.05 level,  $p < 0.05$  and therefore, null hypothesis has been rejected indicating foreign language anxiety plays a major role in making Chinese postgraduates anxious.

### **Limitation of the research study**

The present research is limited in sample size (N=206), Pakistani learners (N=100) from one of the key comprehensive public universities situated in Lahore, Pakistan where students are more exposed to FL or TL and also English is the medium of instruction in that university; due to which they are found to be moderately anxious. Chinese learners (N=106) from one of the public universities situated in Wuhan, China where Chinese students do have a lot of chances to excel in all walks of life and Wuhan, which is famous for being the educational hub and center of China, a massive number of native speakers, foreigners and international students visit every year this city, Chinese postgraduates feel a bit hesitant to use foreign or second language when it comes to academic and social settings.

In present study, Chinese postgraduates of the public sector university mostly use target and FL only in second language acquisition classroom, whereas for the rest of the activities they use mandarin Chinese; therefore, the results couldn't be generalized to the whole population. In addition to it, the study is quantitative in nature; qualitative analysis would've helped more in throwing light on the aspect of FLA.

### **Conclusion**

This research project concludes that both Chinese and Pakistani students feel high and moderate anxiety, respectively. They feel edginess and anxiety while communicating in front of instructors, peers and others. They think that other people and their companions will make fun of them by letting them down if they happen to utter the wrong sentence because of being less capable in target language acquisition. The study has determined the university postgraduates' anxiety in acquisition of second or foreign language.

Learners also get anxious when their instructor rectifies their mistakes, and they are not able to comprehend the corrected words. It makes them less confident, and they also feel hesitant to communicate with native speakers thinking others will laugh at them. They also fear of showing poor performance in FL class and tests. They are reluctant to speak in FL as the majority of them think in first language and then translate that into the second language, which keeps them unconfident and reticent.

All the above-mentioned statements indicate that the university postgraduates need more lectures in foreign and second language to shun away the uneasiness and anxiety feeling, which keeps them discouraged and checks them to participate and interact with others. They also find it hard to adhere strictly to the rules and regulations for learning a foreign language. Most importantly, the significant difference exists between both groups and Pakistani postgraduates according to the second question in the study. To sum up, the second or target language acquisition anxiety plays a pivotal and essential role in acquiring any language.

### **Recommendations**

It is highly recommended in the light of data collection results, discussion, and conclusion that anxiety is found at various levels among learners, whether they are Pakistanis or Chinese. It is recommended that teachers must not make realize or flourish the sense of anxiety even at the lowest level in EFL classroom. Students must be given freedom of expression and not be discouraged or de-motivated at all. Academicians, researchers, and policymakers, government officials must keep studying researches to update their knowledge and design policies in light of these studies' conclusions. Teachers must develop such an environment inside the classroom as it would enhance learners' confidence, level of easy interaction, removing the feelings of shyness and hesitation.

As far as further research is concerned related to this topic, there are many new avenues that can be explored as regards to variation of gender, age, class, socioeconomic background, country, or language. These variables can be addressed individually or by combining more than one or two as desired by the prospective potential researcher. Another area of future study may be a comparison between first and second language anxiety as among some learners, even first language interrupts and they feel lacking proficiency in any of the language skills i.e., productive and receptive skills in their mother tongue.

### **About the Authors:**

**Sameena Malik** is a Ph.D. researcher in the Department of Foreign Languages at Huazhong University of Science & Technology, China. Her areas of interest include second language acquisition, Psycholinguistics, and intercultural communication. She has been serving as an

English Lecturer in LLU, University Lahore, Pakistan. ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4091-2253>

**Huang Qin** is a Dean of the English Department, MIT center, and Ph.D. Professor in the Department of Foreign Languages at Huazhong University of Science & Technology, China. Her research interests include Translation Studies. She has published several papers in SSCI and international linguistics journals as a first author.

**Said Muhammad Khan** is an English Lecturer at YELI, Yanbu University College, Yanbu, Saudi Arabia. His research interests include second language acquisition, foreign language anxiety and applied linguistics.

**Khalid Ahmed** is an Assistant Professor at the University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan. He holds a Ph.D. degree in Applied Linguistics and Corpus Linguistics. He has published several papers in well-renowned journals as a first and second author.

## References

- Abbas, F., & Iqbal, Z. (2018). Language Attitude of the Pakistani Youth towards English, Urdu and Punjabi: A Comparative Study. *Pakistan Journal of Distance and Online Learning*, 4 (1), 199–214.
- Abbas, F., Jalil, M. K., & Rehman, Z. (2019). The Status of Punjabi Language in the Province of Punjab, Pakistan. *Dialogue (1819-6462)*, 14(2).
- Abbas, F., Pervaiz, A., & Arshad, F. (2018). The competing status of Urdu and English after declaration of Urdu as official language in Pakistan. *Journal of Research (Urdu)*, 34(1), 142–158.
- Adeel, A. (2011). A study of anxiety among the Graduation Learners of English as a Foreign Language in Pakistan. *1st International Conference on Foreign Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics, Sarajevo*.
- Aida, Y. (1994). Examination of Horwitz, Horwitz, and Cope's construct of foreign language anxiety: The case of students of Japanese. *The Modern Language Journal*, 78(2), 155–168.
- Azher, M., Anwar, M. N., & Naz, A. (2010). An investigation of foreign language classroom anxiety and its relationship with students achievement. *Journal of College Teaching & Learning (TLC)*, 7(11).
- Bailey, G. (1983). *Problems of site formation and the interpretation of spatial and temporal discontinuities in the distribution of coastal middens*.
- Bhatti, N., & Memon, S. (2016). Investigating the Perceptions of Pakistani English Language Learners on Language Learning Anxiety in EFL Classroom. *Advances in Language and Literary Studies*, 7(5), 23–34.
- Cubukcu, F. (2007). Foreign language anxiety. *Iranian Journal of Language Studies*, 1(2), 133–142.
- Gardner, R. C., & MacIntyre, P. D. (1993). *A student's contributions to second language learning*. Part.
- Gopang, I. B., Ansari, S., Kulsoom, U., & Laghari, A. (2017). An empirical investigation of

- foreign language anxiety in Pakistani university. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 7(2), 21.
- Gopang, I. B., Bughio, F. A., & Pathan, H. (2018). Investigating foreign language learning anxiety among students learning English in a public sector university, Pakistan. *MOJES: Malaysian Online Journal of Educational Sciences*, 3(4), 27–37.
- Goshi, M. (2005). Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety: How Should the Classroom Teacher Deal with it? *Journal of the School of Marine Science and Technology*, 3(2), 61–66.
- Gregersen, T., & Horwitz, E. K. (2002). Language learning and perfectionism: Anxious and non-anxious language learners' reactions to their own oral performance. *The Modern Language Journal*, 86(4), 562–570.
- Gregersen, T. S. (2005). Nonverbal cues: Clues to the detection of foreign language anxiety. *Foreign Language Annals*, 38(3), 388–400.
- He, D. (2017). How to Cope with Foreign Language Speaking Anxiety Effectively? The Case of University Students in China. *Electronic Journal of Foreign Language Teaching*, 14(2).
- Hismanoglu, M. (2013). Foreign language anxiety of English language teacher candidates: A sample from Turkey. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 93, 930–937.
- Horwitz, E. K. (1986). Preliminary evidence for the reliability and validity of a foreign language anxiety scale. *Tesol Quarterly*, 20(3), 559–562.
- Horwitz, E. K., Horwitz, M. B., & Cope, J. (1986). Foreign language classroom anxiety. *The Modern Language Journal*, 70(2), 125–132.
- Huang, H. W. (2004). The relationship between learning motivation and speaking anxiety among EFL non-English major freshmen in Taiwan. *Unpublished Master's Thesis, Chaoyang University of Technology*.
- Javed, M., Eng, L. S., Mohamed, A. R., & Sam, R. (2013). Comparative Study of the Pakistani and Indonesian Student's Anxiety Towards the English Language Learning. *Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research*, 18(11), 1563–1572.
- Karatas, H., Alci, B., Bademcioglu, M., & Ergin, A. (2016). An Investigation into University Students' Foreign Language Speaking Anxiety. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 232(April), 382–388. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2016.10.053>
- Kitano, K. (2001). Anxiety in the college Japanese language classroom. *The Modern Language Journal*, 85(4), 549–566.
- Koba, N., Ogawa, N., & Wilkinson, D. (2000). Using the community language learning approach to cope with language anxiety. *The Internet TESL Journal*, 6(11), 1–5.
- Landström, P. (2015). *Foreign language anxiety among Chinese senior middle school students: A case study*.
- Liu, M., & Braine, G. (2005). Cohesive features in argumentative writing produced by Chinese undergraduates. *System*, 33(4), 623–636.
- MacIntyre, P. D., & Charos, C. (1996). Personality, attitudes, and affect as predictors of second language communication. *Journal of Language and Social Psychology*, 15(1), 3–26.
- MacIntyre, P. D., & Gardner, R. C. (1994). The subtle effects of language anxiety on cognitive processing in the second language. *Language Learning*, 44(2), 283–305.
- Malik, S., Qin, H., Asif, M., & Khan, S. M. (2020). An Investigation of Xenoglossophobia among Chinese Postgraduates. *European Online Journal of Natural and Social Sciences*, 9(1), pp-104.

- Marcos-Llinás, M., & Garau, M. J. (2009). Effects of language anxiety on three proficiency-level courses of Spanish as a foreign language. *Foreign Language Annals*, 42(1), 94–111.
- Mari, M. A., Umrani, T. H., & Umrani, S. (2012). An investigation of Pakistani EFL learners' communication anxiety. *ELF Annual Research Journal*, 14, 31–43.
- Marwan, A. (2016). Investigating students' foreign language anxiety. *Malaysian Journal of ELT Research*, 3(1), 19.
- Naudhani, M., Wu, Z., & Naudhani, S. (2018). Exploring the Factors of Foreign Language Anxiety Among Chinese Undergraduate English Majors and Non-English Majors. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 8(5), 142–150.
- Ohata, K. (2005). Potential sources of anxiety for Japanese learners of English: Preliminary case interviews with five Japanese college students in the US. *TESL-EJ*, 9(3), n3.
- Oxford, R. L. (1999). Anxiety and the language learner: New insights. *Affect in Language Learning*, 58–67.
- Öztürk, G., & Gürbüz, N. (2013). The impact of gender on foreign language speaking anxiety and motivation. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 70, 654–665.
- Rachman, S. (1998). A cognitive theory of obsessions. In *Behavior and Cognitive Therapy Today* (pp. 209–222). Elsevier.
- Sarason, I. G. (1984). Stress, anxiety, and cognitive interference: reactions to tests. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 46(4), 929.
- Scovel, T. (1978). The effect of affect on foreign language learning: A review of the anxiety research. *Language Learning*, 28(1), 129–142.
- Shi, Y.-Z., & Liu, Z.-Q. (2006). Foreign language reading anxiety and its relationship to English achievement and gender. *Journal of PLA University of Foreign Languages*, 29(2), 59–64.
- Toubot, A. M., & Seng, G. H. (2018). Examining Levels and Factors of Speaking Anxiety among EFL Libyan English Undergraduate Students. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and English Literature*, 7(5), 47–56.
- Trylong, V. L. (1987). Aptitude, Attitudes and Anxiety. *Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation. Purdue University, Indiana.*
- Tschumi, B., & Young, R. (1994). *The Manhattan Transcripts.*
- Wei, J. (2014). A study via interviews of the Chinese Bouyei college learners' EFL classroom anxiety arousals. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 5(2), 419–428.
- Young, D. J. (1991). Creating a low-anxiety classroom environment: What does language anxiety research suggest? *The Modern Language Journal*, 75(4), 426–437.

**Appendixes****Table.1. Mean Score and Standard Deviation for Communication Anxiety among Pakistani & Chinese Postgraduates**

Likert Scale items	Variables	Mean	Std
I never feel quite sure of myself when I am speaking in my foreign language class	Pakistani	2.89	1.024
	postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	3.08	1.048
I don't worry about making mistakes in foreign language class.	Pakistani	3.17	1.223
	postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	3.19	0.957
I tremble when I know that I'm going to be called on in foreign language lecture.	Pakistani	2.62	1.17
	postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	2.79	0.983
It makes me anxious me I don't understand what an instructor is saying in foreign language.	Pakistani	2.43	1.208
	postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	3.21	1.075
It wouldn't bother me at all to take more foreign language classes.	Pakistani	3.65	1.14
	postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	3.74	0.876
During lecture, I find myself thinking about things that have nothing to do with the course.	Pakistani	2.83	1.129
	postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	2.66	1.013
I keep thinking that the other students are better at foreign language than I am.	Pakistani	3.17	1.173
	postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	3.11	1.008
I am usually at ease during assessments in my foreign language class.	Pakistani	3.72	0.842
	postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	3.4	0.902
I start to panic when I have to speak without preparation in foreign language class.	Pakistani	2.9	1.243
	postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	3.17	1.1
I worry about consequences of failing my foreign language class.	Pakistani	2.73	1.196
	postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	3.19	1.088
I don't understand why some people get so upset over foreign language lectures.	Pakistani	3.68	0.875
	postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	3.09	0.961

**Table.2. Mean Score and Standard Deviation for Test Anxiety among Pakistani and Chinese Postgraduates**

Likert Scale items	Variables	Mean	Std
In Foreign language class, I can get so nervous I forget things I know.	Pakistani	2.72	1.12
	postgraduates	3	1.051

	Chinese postgraduates		
It embarrasses me to volunteer answers in foreign language class.	Pakistani postgraduates	2.61	1.154
	Chinese postgraduates	2.81	0.996
I would not be nervous speaking foreign language with native speakers.	Pakistani postgraduates	3.52	0.979
	Chinese postgraduates	3.51	0.928
I get upset when I don't understand what the teacher is correcting.	Pakistani postgraduates	2.93	1.139
	Chinese postgraduates	3.38	0.899
Even if I am well prepared for foreign language class, I feel anxious about it.	Pakistani postgraduates	2.91	1.147
	Chinese postgraduates	2.91	1.074
I often feel like not going to my foreign language class.	Pakistani postgraduates	2.33	1.064
	Chinese postgraduates	2.32	0.971
I feel confident when I speak in my foreign language class.	Pakistani postgraduates	3.72	0.986
	Chinese postgraduates	3.3	0.864
I am afraid that my foreign instructor is ready to correct every mistake I make.	Pakistani postgraduates	2.77	1.136
	Chinese postgraduates	2.75	0.892
I can feel my heart pounding when I am going to be called on in my class.	Pakistani postgraduates	2.74	1.177
	Chinese postgraduates	3.11	1.008
The more I study for foreign language course, the more confused I get.	Pakistani postgraduates	2.25	1.086
	Chinese postgraduates	2.45	0.906
I don't feel pressure to prepare very well for foreign language class.	Pakistani postgraduates	3.63	1.031
	Chinese postgraduates	3.17	0.91

**Table.3. Mean Score and Standard Deviation for Fear of Negative Evaluation among Pakistan and Chinese Postgraduates**

Likert Scale items	Variables	Mean	Std
I always feel that the other students speak foreign language better than I do.	Pakistani	3.14	1.073
	postgraduates	3.13	1.07
	Chinese postgraduates		

I feel very self-conscious about speaking foreign language in front of other students.	Pakistani postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	3.19 3.32	1.032 0.911
Foreign language class moves so quickly I worry about getting left behind.	Pakistani postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	3.67 2.79	0.933 1.002
I feel more tense and nervous in my foreign language class than in my other courses.	Pakistani postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	2.39 2.66	1.081 1.05
I get nervous and confused when I am speaking in my foreign language class.	Pakistani postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	2.46 2.68	1.141 1.01
When I am on my way to foreign language class, I feel very sure and relaxed.	Pakistani postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	3.67 3.55	0.943 0.745
I get nervous when I don't understand every word the foreign instructor says.	Pakistani postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	2.8 3.23	1.082 0.908
I feel overwhelmed by the number of rules you have to learn to speak foreign language.	Pakistani postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	3.11 2.98	1.1 0.985
I am afraid that the other students will laugh at me when I speak foreign language.	Pakistani postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	2.61 2.79	1.188 1.144
I would probably feel comfortable around the native speakers of foreign language.	Pakistani postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	3.45 3.44	0.914 0.84
I get nervous when the foreign instructor asks questions which I haven't prepared.	Pakistani postgraduates Chinese postgraduates	2.98 3.3	1.155 0.841

**Table.4. Independent samples t-test result of Foreign Language Anxiety of Chinese and Pakistani postgraduates**

Groups	N	Mean	Std	t	Sig.(2-tailed)
<b>Chinese postgraduates</b>	106	3.07	0.47	2.642	0.01
<b>Pakistani postgraduates</b>	100	2.98	0.50	0.269	0.788